

Instructor: Dr. dt ogilvie
Office: 1WP Room 1030
Office Hours: Wednesday after class or by appointment
Class Site: <https://newark.blackboard.rutgers.edu>
Email: dt@dragon.rutgers.edu

To ensure your email gets to me in a timely manner, use the above email address and put ENT Seminar in the subject line.

Note: This syllabus is subject to change.

**26:620:685:02, PhD Seminar, Spring 2011
SEMINAR in Entrepreneurship
Wednesdays 2:30 pm –5:20 pm, 1WP-532**

PhD Seminar on Entrepreneurship

Course Overview

The field of entrepreneurship is experiencing an exciting period in its development. On the one hand, the value of entrepreneurship finds the process being applied in various domains, from strategic management, political science, poverty alleviation, and institutional theory, among others. On the other hand, the complexity of entrepreneurship as a process finds the study of entrepreneurship being informed from different disciplines, from psychology to finance to economics, among numerous other disciplines as well. As such, a diverse set of research streams has recently emerged in each of these different areas exploring entrepreneurship-related phenomena. The objective of this seminar is to provide you with awareness and understanding of a number of these emerging research streams.

This doctoral seminar is designed to acquaint you with the theories and research related to Entrepreneurship research. Our examination of the literature covers several broad topics: definition of the field, new venture creation, financing, growth, cognitive issues, and research methods. We will focus on the main questions that define the field and attempt to critically examine how, using a range of methodologies, researchers have approached these questions. You will examine a number of articles concerning each topic, questions that are as yet unexplored, and some the methodological issues that must be tackled to conduct empirical research in the area.

As we review the literature, we will seek to identify promising research areas, which may be of interest to you in the context of your summer papers and/or dissertation research. In addition to addressing the content of the received literature, we will examine the process of crafting research papers and getting them published in top tier journals. Towards that end, we will characterize the key elements of high impact papers and review the development process of such studies.

The seminar is also designed to expose you to the broad research interests of the Entrepreneurship Faculty in the Management & Global Business Department. Focusing on their current research, each of the Entrepreneurship Faculty will lead a class meeting. We may also have leading Entrepreneurship Scholars from area schools act as guest professors for the class. By familiarizing you with the research of our and other faculty, we seek to encourage and inspire you to engage in rigorous entrepreneurship research.

You are expected to come fully prepared to discuss and critique the readings that are

assigned to each class meeting. Each student will serve as the discussion leader for one or more of the class sessions. Discussion leaders are expected to critically review several articles, identify new insights in the research that is being reviewed and evaluate its contribution to the literature, position the articles within the literature on the subject matter, raise discussion questions, and act as the discussion moderator for the class session. Each discussion leader is asked to prepare a one or two page summary of the assigned papers which includes a statement of the main research question(s), the methodology, data set if any, summary of findings, a commentary with your thoughts on the reading, and proposed discussion questions. Prior to each class, the discussion leader will meet the instructor to help plan the class meeting. Towards the end of each class meeting, each student will be asked to articulate a research question that emerged from the session and describe the research design used to investigate the issue.

Finally, you are required to submit a research paper relating to a topic covered in the course. This paper has several purposes: First, is to encourage experimentation on possible first- or second-year paper topics. Second, is to develop your ability to carry out research in the entrepreneurship field. Third, is for you to have a paper that can be submitted to the Academy of Management (or other) conference. Fourth, is for you to begin to explore a topic that may turn into your dissertation project.

Academia socializes students well in the art of criticism, but does not do a good job of socializing students in the art of discovering insight in others' work. For this reason, we will emphasize the identification of insight in the works that have been selected.

Because this course will be conducted as a seminar, you are expected to come to class prepared to discuss, critique, and draw insights from the readings.

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This PhD seminar is designed to: (1) survey the major theoretical perspectives and issues studied in entrepreneurship research, and (2) provide an interdisciplinary perspective on contemporary issues in entrepreneurship. It has the following goals:

- 1- To familiarize you with the content and methods of the entrepreneurship literature as a basis for the development of a dissertation proposal in the field,
- 2- To equip you with the skills to understand, analyze, and critique research articles in the field, as a basis for identifying limitations and gaps in the existing literature as well as for future reviewing work, and
- 3- To provide you with the skills to write a research proposal that could be submitted to a major academic conference in the field: the Academy of Management (AOM), the Academy of International Business (AIB), the Strategic Management Society (SMS), or other major disciplinary conference.

Seminar Objectives:

1. You should develop a basic understanding of the literature in Entrepreneurship, and be able to describe the key concepts, theories, and interconnected research streams in Entrepreneurship.

2. You should develop an understanding of the major theories, issues, and contributions in the field of entrepreneurship and should be able to assess the relative contribution of individual works in the field with respect to theory development, empirical validity, and theory testing.
3. You should be able to summarize, integrate, evaluate, and extend the theory and research in entrepreneurship.
4. You should be able to evaluate and critically review academic writings in the field of Entrepreneurship.
5. You should develop new ideas and/or approaches that contribute to some portion of the theory/research on Entrepreneurship and that may be developed into a dissertation proposal or published paper.
6. You should be able to communicate, in oral and written form, knowledge, ideas, critical evaluations, and individual contributions to the Entrepreneurship literature.
7. You should develop career skills for success in the Ph.D. program and your professional career. These skills include thinking clearly and quickly, and communicating effectively both orally and in writing.

Finally, this course is as much about the process of your academic development as it is about the content of the papers we review.

NB: This is not an applied entrepreneurship course but instead is a seminar that surveys the relevant theoretical and empirical entrepreneurship literature with the aim of preparing you to publish in top academic management journals such as Journal of Business Ventures, Entrepreneurship Theory & Practice, Administrative Science Quarterly, Academy of Management Journal and Academy of Management Review, and Strategic Management Journal.

While sessions may differ somewhat in their execution, each session will generally follow the organization of an empirical journal article -- theory, methods, results, and discussion. You will start the session by noting the theoretical questions that are raised and the theories that are brought to bear on them. Next, the methods of testing and the findings from the studies will be summarized such that you will be able to state "what you have learned from this body of research." Finally, we will conclude each session by outlining new research questions that are raised by the research -- you will be able to define extensions of the research, unanswered questions, and avenues for future research.

An important part of this course will be your socialization into the journal review process. Entrepreneurship is consummately concerned with performance, and "publish or perish" is a very relevant performance criterion for aspiring academics. Therefore, about two-thirds of the way through the semester, a draft of your research paper for this class will be submitted to the Journal of Interdisciplinary Entrepreneurship Research for double-blind peer review. Coincidentally, you are also a reviewer for this same hallowed journal.

“Instructor” Role

Instructor is a misnomer for my role. My job is primarily to select material that will teach and insure that our discussions engage the material so that it can do its job. This is not a lecture class,

it is an advanced, PhD seminar. In advanced study, carefully selected readings will go a long way to instructing. *Importantly, it is the quality of student preparation and participation that makes a seminar.* That is to say, *my role in our discussions will be more to question and prod rather than evaluate or explain.* I fully expect to be learning *with* and *from* you through our discussions.

Course Format

The literature around entrepreneurship is quite varied, voluminous, and can be organized in many ways. This instructor has chosen one way to organize the literature. In our fourteen weeks together, we will only get to examine a slice of this literature. We will focus each week upon a particular topic.

Below are questions that are designed to help you prepare for the seminar sessions

1. What kind of phenomena and/or problems are the authors concerned with describing and/or explaining?
2. By what methods do they think such knowledge can be acquired? By what methods do they think such knowledge can be applied?
3. What are their key concepts? How are these concepts connected?
4. What kind of data do they collect?
5. What are their major contributions?
 - a) More descriptive information about a particular phenomenon?
 - b) A new conceptual scheme (useful way of thinking) for
 - (I) investigation and research;
 - (ii) improved practice; or (iii) both?
 - c) A new method or a refinement of an old one?
 - d) New findings (empirical generalizations, correlations, statements that a significant relationship exists between X and Y, causal relations)?
 - e) A new theoretical explanation for the findings?
6. What assumptions are they making with respect to values, human nature, and method?
7. What are some of the major weaknesses of their work? How might these weaknesses be addressed?

Grades

Grades will be based on the following components:

Active participation in class discussions: 25%

Discussion leader sessions: 25%

Referee review of article: 25%

Final journal-targeted paper: 25%

Class Discussions: Every student is responsible for every assigned article. Each week, one student will take *primary* responsibility for the class.

Participation will involve the following requirements:

1. Reading assigned articles and other materials
2. Active participation in class discussion of all readings
3. Regular attendance

Although every student is responsible for every assigned article, one student will take primary responsibility for an article each week and act as the discussion leader.

Discussion leaders have the following requirements:

1. Provide an organized summary of each assigned reading
2. Evaluate and provide a synthesis of the assigned readings and thoughts for future research
3. Disseminate copies of the summary and evaluation to everyone in the seminar
4. Initiate and lead class discussion of the assigned readings

Review of article and response to review will be a formal review of a fellow student's submission of a polished draft of her or his final paper and the author's response to the reviewer. You must:

1. Provide a thoughtful analysis and review of the assigned paper that is designed to help the author improve the paper
2. Respond to the reviewer addressing the points raised and incorporate the relevant issues into your final paper.

Final journal-targeted paper will involve the following requirements:

1. Writing a full paper examining entrepreneurship-related phenomena tailored to a specific journal..
2. Submitting a polished draft for blind-review
3. Responding to the reviewer and incorporating the feedback into your paper as appropriate
4. Meeting relevant due dates.

See below for a more detailed template of your responsibilities.

Course Requirements:

Class Preparation and Participation (25% of grade) - Each participant is required to come prepared to class. Student preparation is critical and an important part of the evaluation of performance will be based on student preparedness and internalization of concepts as evidenced by in-class discussion. Since class discussion is an integral part of a seminar, absences and lack of preparedness are unacceptable. Preparation will always involve reading the weekly assignments. In addition, each class will be assigned to a discussion leader (see details of this role below), who will prepare a short (preferably a single page) written synopsis/critique of the articles (see format below). While I will provide some comments during class, most of the course will involve engaging in discussions about seminar topics. The sessions will consist in *you* critically discussing the articles assigned for each session with the aim of identifying their contributions, limitations, and possible avenues for future research in each topic. Here, the emphasis is on *quality* rather than quantity, on *insight* rather than summary.

The class participation grade is based on your regular daily class participation. In our profession, you are paid to not only know, but to be able to explain and contribute. Silently attending class is unacceptable as it indicates to me that you either know nothing about the day's readings, or you are unable to express what you know to others. Both conclusions are to the detriment of your participation grade.

You are responsible for downloading the reading assignments from our web-library resources and obtaining inaccessible articles through inter-library loan or other sources.

Research creativity is a fundamental skill of the successful researcher. As you read the literature, you should always look for research opportunities that will create value to the literature. To assist you in developing this skill, you should write “idea pages.” The purpose of the “idea page” is to provide you with an instrument for exploring research gaps in the literature. You should turn in 5 idea pages over the semester. Idea pages are outlines of a potential empirical research question that would make a contribution to the literature discussed in class. They should not exceed one page of single-spaced typed text. The research idea should relate to the material discussed in class that day, and should discuss the *what*, *why* and *how* of your research idea. Idea pages will be due in my email box at 8:00 a.m. the day before class. I may select one or two of the most promising idea pages and allocate time for discussion in class. This will provide authors of promising ideas with valuable feedback on their research idea. It is critical that students behave ethically in respecting “idea ownership rights” of others.

Discussion Leadership (25% of grade) – You will assume the role of “professor” in leading the class in discussing the articles for the week. More than that, you will gain experience in synthesizing the week’s readings; this experience will help you in your research and writing.

Review (25% of grade) - Reviewing others’ papers is an important part of your role as an academic. As a member of the review board for the Journal of Interdisciplinary Entrepreneurship Research, you are responsible for providing a quality review of two journal articles submitted to the blind review process.

Responding to reviewers is a critical ability and skill in getting papers to publication. You need to let your reviewers know how you have used their feedback.

Keep your reviews to two, single-spaced pages and your responses to reviewers to six single-spaced pages.

Individual Research Paper (25% of grade) - Participants will also write an original research paper that relates a topic(s) covered in class to their own research interests. The final product will include an extensive literature review of your research topic, develop logical and intriguing hypotheses and original arguments, contain a methods section with a research design and data analysis, and suggest directions for future research. The term paper should follow the following logical steps: (1) define a research question, (2) review and critique the extant literature, (3) develop a few testable hypotheses, (4) identify a data source, (5) test the proposed hypotheses, and (6) discuss the implications and extensions of your research (see Research Paper Guidelines below).

Each paper should be written in the form of an empirical journal article (like JBV, ETP, SMJ, AMJ, or ASQ), and will undergo a “journal review process.” Papers spanning entrepreneurship and other disciplines such as accounting, finance, marketing, organization theory, economics, sociology, or other disciplines are also acceptable -- subject to a prior approval of the subject matter by the instructor. In our last session participants will present their research paper to others in the class. The presentation will follow the format of an Academy of Management presentation and will be about 10-15 minutes in length. Your final grade will reflect your presentation, revised paper (in response to reviewers), and your written responses to the reviewers of the Journal of Interdisciplinary Entrepreneurship Research.

There will be no incomplete grades given for incomplete papers. If you want to further polish the paper, it can be done after the semester but this work will not be graded using the incomplete grade.

I will assign your grade for this seminar as a function of:

- 1- Degree and quality of participation – Participation is very important. The profession consists in carrying out dialogues both orally and in written. You need to express your ideas and opinions, as clearly as possible.
- 2- Quality of writing and presentation – I value the accuracy in reporting the authors' work, you adopting a critical stance in assessing the quality of the author's work, and your creativity in identifying avenues for future research.
- 3- Quality of integration
- 4- Quality of final paper – You need to lay out a research question based on a gap identified you identified in your literature review. For the literature review, I recommend reading some of the recent optional readings in the domain listed in the appendix.

To receive a grade of C on the course assignments, students must show at least a broad knowledge of the relevant literature. To receive a B, students must show at least a broad knowledge of the literature, plus an ability to integrate that literature to show linkages, relationships, etc. To receive an A, students must show at least a broad knowledge of the literature, an ability to integrate the literature, and *creative insight that is not already present in the literature.*

Please be careful about the back-loaded grades in this class. Eighty percent of the grades are assigned at the end of the semester (participation, paper review,). Of course, these grades are earned for your work over the whole semester. Feel free to talk to me to get feedback about your performance in class. Don't wait for your grades as a wake-up call; it's too late!

Plagiarism

There is one fundamental norm in the academic profession: you cannot mention others' ideas or words you have read or heard about in different settings (including conferences) without proper acknowledgement of the source. So, when you use others' ideas, be sure to cite them. If you quote others' work, be sure not only to cite them, but use quotation marks as well since citing quoted material without quote marks is considered plagiarism. Otherwise, if found, it is grounds for dismissal from the course, disciplinary action, and may result in being expelled from the program, severely tainting your reputation in the academic profession. All written assignments will be entered into Safe Assign.

NOTE

As for any well-established research area, it is practically impossible to cover all the important contributions to Entrepreneurship in the space of one doctoral seminar. All that we can achieve in the seminar is to introduce you to the theoretical foundations of the field and to expose you to some research in promising and critical areas. It is your responsibility to expand your knowledge of the area through individual exploration and conversation with other faculty and students. To help out in your individual exploration, I have often provided extra references on the topics covered. These may be helpful for your focusing on a particular topic. In addition, many of the topics that we cover in one day could be the topic of a whole doctoral seminar.

COURSE CALENDAR

Please note that this is a tentative schedule. Some topics may be rearranged or changed due to guest professors' schedules. If I am forced to reschedule a class, I will do so in the most convenient way for everyone, and as close to the original date as possible.

WEEK	DATE	DUE	CONTENT	PROFESSOR	LEAD
1	Jan 19		Introduction to Entrepreneurship/ Overview and Classics	dt ogilvie	
2	Jan 26		Methods In Entrepreneurship Research	dt ogilvie	
3	Feb 2		Social Entrepreneurship, Social Wealth Creation, & Urban Entrepreneurship	Jeffrey Robinson	
4	Feb 9		New Venture Creation and Entrepreneurial Growth	Patti Greene	
5	Feb 16		University Entrepreneurship and Technology Transfer	Joanne Scillitoe	
6	Feb 23	2-3 page outline of paper	Creativity and Arts Entrepreneurship	Arturo Osorio	
7	Mar 2		The Micro-Economics of Entrepreneurship	Will Baumol	
8	Mar 9		SPRING BREAK – NO CLASS		
9	Mar 16		Entrepreneurial Finance and Venture Capital	Rafi Amit	
10	Mar 23		Minority Business Entrepreneurs and Supply Chains	Quintus Jett	
11	Mar 30	Your JISM submission*	Gender & Race	Donna Stoddard, Mary Godwyn	
12	Apr 6		Entrepreneurial Collaboration/Teams	Martin Ruef	
13	Apr 13	Your reviews*	Innovation and Entrepreneurial Management	Murray Low	
14	Apr 20		Entrepreneurship. Economics. and Austrian Perspectives	dt ogilvie	
15	Apr 27		Cognition/Psychological Explanations For Enterprising Behavior, Entrepreneurial Orientation	dt ogilvie	
		Your final paper and reviewer responses*			

***Incompletes will not be accepted and will negatively affect your grade.**

READINGS

1. Introduction to Entrepreneurship/ Overview and Classics

- Amit, R., Glosten, L. & Muller, E. 1993. Challenges to theory development in entrepreneurship research. *Journal of Management Studies*, 30(5): 815-834.
- Kirzner, I.M. 1997. Entrepreneurial discovery and the competitive market process: An Austrian approach. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 35: 60-85.
- Knight, F. 1921. *Risk uncertainty and profits*: Boston: Houghton Mifflin. Parts III, Chapter 9. <http://www.econlib.org/library/Knight/knRUP.html>.
- Schumpeter, J. 1947. The Creative Response in Economic History. *Journal of Economic Volume* 7(2). 149-159
- Shane, S. & Venkataraman, S. 2000. The promise of entrepreneurship as a field of research. *Academy of Management Review*, 25(1): 217-226.
- Shane, SA 2008. *The Illusions of Entrepreneurship*. Yale University Press: New Haven Connecticut. (Available on Amazon.com for \$12).

Supplementary Material:

- Casson, M. 1982. *The Entrepreneur*. 23-38, 364-383. Totowa, NJ: Barnes and Noble Books.
- Cooper, A C. 2004. Entrepreneurship: The past, the present, and the future. In Zoltan J. Acs and David B. Audretsch (Eds.) *Handbook of Entrepreneurship Research: An Interdisciplinary Survey and Introduction*, Kluwer Academic Publishers: Boston; pp. 21-34.
- Drucker, P. 1985. *Innovation and Entrepreneurship*. New York: Harper & Row, pp 21-36.
- Roberts & H. I. Grousebeck & A Bhide (Eds.), *New Business Ventures and the Entrepreneur*. Boston: Irwin McGraw-Hill: pp. 3-17.
- Parker, S.C. 2004. *The Economics of Self-Employment and Entrepreneurship*, Chapter 2; Cambridge Press: Cambridge.
- Schumpeter, J. 1934. *The Theory of Economic Development*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Schumpeter, J. 1942. *Capitalism, Socialism, and Democracy*. New York: Harper & Row. Chapter VI through VIII.
- Stevenson, H. H. (1999). A perspective of entrepreneurship. In H. H. Stevenson, H. I. Grousebeck, M. J. Roberts and A. Bhide (eds.), *New Business Ventures and the Entrepreneur* (pp. 3-17). Boston: Irwin McGraw-Hill.

2. Methods In Entrepreneurship Research

- Amit, R., Glosten, L., and Muller, E. 1990. Entrepreneurial ability, venture investments, and risk sharing. *Management Science*, 36(10): 1232-1245.
- Hamilton, B., and Nickerson, J. 2003. Correcting for endogeneity in strategic Management research. *Strategic Organization*, 1(1): 51-78.
- Lafontaine, F., and Shaw, K. 1999. The dynamics of franchise contracting: Evidence from panel data. *Journal of Political Economy*. 107(5): 1041-1080.
- Malerba, F., Nelson, R., Orsenigo, L., Winter, S. 1999. 'History-friendly models of industry evolution: The computer industry. *Industrial and Corporate Change*, 8: 3-40.

Supplementary Material:

- Carroll, G., and Hannan, M. 2000. *The Demography of Corporations and Industries*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 83-99.

Article Synopsis/Critique Format

You should distribute and present the synopsis in class for 5-10 minutes, followed by comments from and discussion with the other students, as well as myself. The synopsis should be preferably be 1 page but no more than 2 pages (11 point font and single-spaced) and reproduce the structure of a typical paper which contains the following sections (sections 3 through 5 do not apply for theory papers, only for empirical ones), with a header showing the complete reference for the article. Use subheadings!

- 1- Research question (1 sentence ending in ?)
- 2- Hypotheses (or Propositions) and the theoretical arguments supporting each of them (1 sentence each)
- 3- Explanations of the key constructs in the paper
- 4- Population and sample characteristics (1 sentence)
- 5- Methods (operationalization of key variables, data sources, and statistical specification)
- 6- Results (i.e. whether hypotheses were supported or not, use abbreviations like H1 for Hypothesis 1)
- 7- Key findings/conclusions and interpretations thereof
- 8- Limitations: a) the ones identified by the author/s and, more importantly, b) any additional you might find, particularly any fatal flaws you might uncover
- 9- Your assessment of the strengths/weaknesses of the study, arguments, or methods, and its contributions to the literature
- 10- Avenues for future research, especially your own ideas (and not just the author/s')

From my experience, these summaries greatly help you to prepare for your comprehensive exam and build your "knowledge database" for future reference. *Please follow the format guidelines outlined above and bring enough printed paper summaries to the class to distribute to all the participants (including me; you should also submit an electronic copy on Blackboard).* We will spend around 15-20 minutes per article and still have time for the integration and wrap-up at the end of the session (at least 20 minutes).

For each session (except the first one), a student will volunteer to be responsible for preparing and presenting the integration. The integration consists of comparing and contrasting the different articles in the session, identifying existing and potential links, gaps and contradictions, as well as links with other sessions and seminars. In the first session, students will choose which session/s to integrate. You should send me *via email* a draft of your integration framework *2 days prior* to the session, to be discussed with me before the session, if necessary.

Discussion Leader Role

Each student will serve as a discussion leader for a session. The session leader's role will include the following:

- a. Provide introductory remarks at the beginning of the session, providing an overview of the topic, without discussing the individual readings in detail. Identify the overall themes, gaps, and tensions in the particular research stream.
- b. Manage the discussion during the session. This includes seeding questions, and involving all participants in the discussion.
- c. At the end of the session take 10-15 minutes to summarize the session, provide insights into the 3-5 most interesting patterns of findings that have been encountered by researchers, and propose ways in which the readings either reinforce or contradict each other. Here the focus is on synthesis. You also need to identify opportunities for future research.
- d. Provide a written summary of the session (1-2 pages typed single-spaced), reflecting on issues highlighted (particularly in points a. and c). The focus is on synthesizing the literature, and on reflecting thoughtful arguments. The summary is due at the beginning of the **following** session. You may circulate it via email.

Research Paper Guidelines

You are required to submit a research paper relating to a topic covered in the course. The purpose of this paper is to encourage experimentation on possible first- or second-year paper topics as well as develop your ability to carry out research in the entrepreneurship field. Another goal is for you to have a paper that can be submitted to an academic conference. This paper should, at a minimum,

- e. discover and motivate a research question germane to strategic management. This should be done in the introduction, where you identify the research question, briefly describe what prior work has done and what is missing, and indicate what you will do to ameliorate the problem. Each of these issues should be addressed in one paragraph.
- f. review and synthesize the literature in entrepreneurship and other fields related to the question. A literature review should be held in a persuasive argument fashion.
- g. develop testable (non-obvious) hypotheses,
- h. outline a research design in the methods section,
- i. collect and analyze data, and report the results,
- j. add a conclusion section where you focus on literature contribution, limitations, and future research; and
- k. further prepare the paper for submission to the Academy of Management annual conference (use AMJ style guide, to be found in first issue of each year or on the AOM website <http://aom.pace.edu/AMJ/>).

PhD Entrepreneurship Seminar Spring 2011 - Personal Data Sheet

Please provide me the following information. I'd like to know something about your experiences and plans.

Name: _____

Email:

Academic Background:

Work Experience:

Research Interests:

Other Information?

